

## Supplemental Material

### Definitions Presented to Participants

#### Study 1 Definitions:

**Agnostic:** An agnostic is someone who believes that God's existence is unknown.

**Atheist:** An atheist is someone who believes that there is no God.

**Christian:** A Christian is someone who believes there is a God and follows the teachings of Jesus Christ.

#### Study 2 Definitions:

**Agnostic:** Agnostics believe that God's existence is unknown.

**Atheist:** Atheists believe that there is no God.

**Protestant:** Protestants believe in a single God and are Christians. Several churches are Protestant, including the Baptist, Presbyterian, and Lutheran churches.

## Definitions of atheists and agnostics from Online Encyclopedias

### **Atheists:**

A lack of belief or a strong disbelief in the existence of a god or any gods. (Merriam-Webster)

Lack of belief in the existence of God or gods. (Oxford)

Atheism is, in the broadest sense, an absence of belief in the existence of deities. (Wikipedia)

### **Agnostics:**

The view that any ultimate reality (such as a deity) is unknown and probably unknowable. (Merriam-Webster)

The belief that it is not possible to know whether God exists or not. (Oxford)

Agnosticism is the view that the existence of God, of the divine or the supernatural is unknown or unknowable (Wikipedia)

Theological Identification versus Self-labelled Identification of Participants Collapsed Across  
Study 1 and 2

Table S1

	<b>Self-labelled Agnostic</b>	<b>Self-labelled Atheist</b>	<b>Self-labelled Christian</b>
I am 100% sure that God exists	1 (1.39%)	-	89 (59.33%)
I cannot know for certain but I strongly believe in God and I live my life on the assumption that He is there	3 (4.17%)	-	28 (18.67%)
I am very uncertain, but I am inclined to believe in God's existence	9 (12.5%)	-	14 (09.33%)
God's existence and non-existence are exactly equiprobable	13 (18.06%)	-	9 (6.00%)
I am very uncertain, but I am inclined to be skeptical of God's existence.	18 (25.00%)	-	6 (4.00%)
I cannot know for certain but I think God is very improbable and I live my life under the assumption that He is not there	26 (36.11%)	19 (32.76%)	1 (0.67%)
I am 100% sure that God does not exist	2 (3.78%)	39 (67.24%)	3 (2.00%)

## Study 1 – Coding Procedure

To begin, they conducted frequency counts of the stereotypes that participants used. Next, they standardized the data by turning phrases into single-word expressions, when possible (e.g., ‘not moral’ into ‘immoral’). RAs created roots by pruning words in the list. This process ensured that variations of a word were included in the dictionary.

With the wordlists, synonyms were combined under a single term (e.g., “heartless” became “cold\*”). We used <http://www.thesaurus.com/> to decide how to group words together. To make changes, the spreadsheets were loaded into Google’s Open Refine Program. This allowed for words (e.g., “heartless”) to be changed across all sheets simultaneously (e.g., to “cold\*”) to maintain consistency. Next, we eliminated words that had a count of one for a single group and that were not listed for any of the other groups. Finally, we combined the data from the two conditions (definitions given versus definitions generated) into a single dataset.

In order to assess how often participants conflated agnosticism with atheism, two RAs went through the list of generated definitions for atheists and agnostics and coded them as either being correct, conflated with the other group, or incorrect and unrelated definitionally to the other group. They used definitions from online encyclopedias to aid in their judgments (see Supplemental Materials for encyclopedia definitions). When the RAs had disagreements, the primary investigator made the final decision. For agnosticism, RAs had 77% agreement; for atheism, RAs had 86% agreement. The lower interrater agreement for agnosticism is discussed in the general discussion section.

## Study 1 - Results

Table S2

*Definitions Reported for Agnostics*

Someone who believes faith cannot be proven and therefore whether God exists or not is a mystery
Unsure of gods existence
Believe in anything and nothing*
Don't believe in god**
Someone who isn't sure or doesn't care about religious matters*
Someone who doesn't know or care whether there is a God or not
Is someone to me who remains neutral and doesn't know what to believe if anything
Someone who isn't sure what to believe
Someone who doesn't believe in anything*
Someone who doesn't have a specific religion but doesn't deny that there is some sort of spiritual/religious truth*
Not sure if God is real
Someone who doesn't know if there is a god
Someone who doesn't know what to believe
Someone who is unsure of the existence of God but does not necessarily doubt it entirely
Someone who believes in space*
Someone who isn't sure if there is a god and/or doesn't believe it is possible to know
Agnostic believes in a higher power*
A person who isn't sure of a god or otherwise
One who does not believe in a deity but may/may not believe in some existence of a god or creator*
Acknowledging the thought of without believing in*
It means that you don't know if there is a God, so you don't really think about it or let it affect your life
Someone who believes that it cannot be proven whether a god exists or not
A person who is unsure about the existence of God
A person who doesn't believe in a god because s/he doesn't know if a God exists or not, it's not proven
Someone that questions the belief of God*
An agnostic is someone who proclaims either than they do not have enough information to determine whether there is a god or that it is impossible to know whether there is a god
Someone who is just not sure if there is a God or Higher Power
Someone who is skeptical about God**
Someone who is not sure whether there is a god
Someone who believes there is a god but does not have a religious affiliation*
An agnostic is someone who doesn't believe or disbelieve in God
Doesn't believe in anything*
Someone who doesn't know if there's a God or not till they have proof
Someone who doesn't believe or disbelieve in god or gods
Someone who refrains from choosing to believe or disbelieve in god or gods, based largely upon the idea that to do otherwise, would assume facts not in evidence
A person who refuses the idea of religion*
Someone who is not sure if there is a God but does not discount the possibility
Someone who doesn't believe what they think can be 100 percent true.
A person who is waiting for evidence as to whether or not to believe in a higher power

Has no faith and believes in nothing**
No faith in God**
Someone who is not sure whether God exists or not
Someone who is unsure of the god situation and would need proof one way or another to really decide
I do not know what an agnostic is*
An agnostic is a person who does not care whether there is a god or not*
A person who does not believe in God but is willing to be proven wrong*
Someone who does not believe in god**
People who don't know if God exist or not.
People who don't think the existence of God is unknown*
Someone who is still searching for a creator*
Feminist*
Believes they do not know the answer
Someone who can't decide what they are but want a title anyways*
Meaning I don't believe in a GOD*

Note. \*incorrect; \*\*conflated with atheism

Table S3

*Definitions Reported for Atheists*

A person who definitively believes there is no God or higher entity
Someone who doesn't believe god
No belief in a god
Don't believe
Someone who has no faith in any religion
Someone who believes there is no God, and no absolute right or wrong*
A person who does not believe in the existence of God
Someone who doesn't believe in God
Someone who doesn't believe in God
Someone who doesn't believe in any religion and believes that there is no spiritual/religious truth
Doesn't believe in God
Someone who doesn't believe in god
A non-believer of any religion
Someone who does not believe in God or organized religion whatsoever
An unbeliever
Someone who does not believe there is a god or gods
A person that doesn't believe in God
A person who doesn't believe in any god
A person that doesn't believe in god
A non-believer in a deity or creator
A person who denies existence of all deities or religious entities
An atheist is someone who doesn't believe that there is a god or gods at all
A person who doesn't believe a god exists
A person who does not believe in any gods or deities
A person who doesn't believe in God
Someone that does not believe in God
Literally speaking, an atheist person who does not believe that there is a god that intervenes in worldly affairs. More commonly, an atheist is a person who does not believe in god

Someone who does not believe a God or higher power exists
Someone who doesn't believe in God
Someone who believes that there is no god
Someone who does not believe anything unless evidence is clear*
An atheist is someone who does not believe in the existence of God
Someone who does not believe in a higher being. believes in science to explain all things
Someone that doesn't believe in a God
Someone who does not believe in any god
Someone who chooses not to believe in god, ostensibly based upon the idea that there is no proof of such and that modern scientific theories sufficiently explain the origins of the universe
Someone who does not believe in a God or Gods and doesn't believe in religion
Someone who does not believe in the existence of God of God's, not religious
Someone who does not believe in the existence of god
A person who does not believe in god or a higher power
Doesn't believe in God
Someone who does not believe in God
Someone who does not believe in the existence of God
Someone who believes there is no god and no possibility of one
Does believe in god*
An atheist is a person who does not believe that there is a god
Someone who adamantly denies any deity at all
Someone who doesn't people in god*
Someone who doesn't believe in God
A person that doesn't believe in God
Who is firm in her beliefs that there isn't a god
Non-believer
Someone who doesn't believe in a higher power or god
Someone who does not believe in any sort of god/afterlife
Someone who doesn't believe in god, but wishes they had a religious title
Means they do not believe in everyone else's god yet still believes in heaven and hell?*

*Note. \*incorrect*

Table S4

*Study 1 Dictionary*

Word	Agnostic	Atheist	Christian
agnostic	0	3	0
America*	0	0	2
angry	1	8	0
annoying	1	4	3
anti-science	0	0	6
arrogan*	11	20	8
atheis*	16	0	0
awesome	2	0	2
backwards	1	1	0
bad	5	14	1
blasphem*	2	0	0
boring	2	0	3
Cathol*	0	0	3
cautio*	3	0	0
charitable	0	0	28
closed-minded	3	3	8
cold*	3	10	0
colourful	1	1	0
combative	2	3	0
confiden*	1	2	2
confus*	17	4	0
conservativ*	0	0	19
contemplative	2	0	0
control*	0	2	3
correct	0	0	2
coward*	8	0	0
craz*	2	1	1
curious	7	0	0
danger*	0	2	0
degenerate	0	3	1
denial	1	1	0
devot*	0	0	4
different	2	1	0
directionless	5	3	0
ethical	0	0	5



evangelical	0	0	2
evidence	2	0	0
evil	6	25	0
extrem*	0	0	5
faithful	3	0	13
faithless	32	18	0
family-oriented	0	0	4
fence-sitters	6	0	0
filth*	2	0	0
God	0	0	2
good*	1	0	11
goth*	2	3	0
hard	0	2	0
hard-headed	2	5	3
hedonis*	1	2	0
hellbound	7	6	0
hippy	2	1	0
hipster	1	1	0
holy	0	0	10
honest	3	2	9
hopeful	1	0	4
hopeless	5	8	0
humble	2	0	3
humorous	2	1	0
hypocrit*	0	1	21
ignorant*	8	5	7
immoral*	16	36	0
indecisive	44	1	0
indifferent	6	1	0
individual*	3	2	0
intell*	11	8	3
intolerant*	11	33	29
irrational	2	0	4
judg*	1	2	24
kind*	15	1	50
lazy	4	0	0
liberal	2	6	1
loud*	1	3	0
mean*	7	20	3

misunderstood	0	3	0
modern	1	1	0
moral*	0	0	13
negative	1	4	1
neutral	7	0	0
nihilist	0	2	0
nonreligious	19	18	0
normal	0	1	3
obidien*	0	0	2
peace*	0	0	4
pious	0	0	6
pitiful	1	0	1
pliable	2	0	0
prolife	0	0	2
proud	0	2	2
prude	0	0	8
pure*	0	1	4
pushy	0	7	20
questioning	22	12	0
rational	11	7	0
rebellious	4	9	0
reckless	3	8	0
religio*	0	0	43
role model	0	0	2
rude	3	15	3
satan*	7	23	0
scien*	14	4	0
selfish	6	6	3
serious*	0	0	3
sin*	8	7	1
socia*	1	0	1
stupid	14	12	11
superior	0	2	6
superstitious	0	0	2
toleran*	11	2	1
tradition*	0	0	2
trustworthy	0	0	2
unethical	2	7	1

unfaithful	4	0	0
unholy	2	6	0
unjust	0	0	2
unknown	1	1	0
unpatriotic	1	4	0
unrealistic	1	3	1
unreliable	2	0	0
unsocial	1	3	0
untrustworthy	9	8	8
uptight	3	2	2
violen*	1	0	1
weak*	5	1	1
wears fedoras	0	2	0
weird	7	1	1
White	0	5	3
wrong	6	10	3
young	9	4	0

---

Table S5

*Fisher's Exact Results for Agnostic Stereotype Content Comparisons*

<b>Word</b>	<b>Definition Provided Count</b>	<b>Definition Generated Count</b>	<b>p-value</b>
arrogan*	9	2	.059
confused	6	11	.313
faithless	19	13	.340
hellbound	7	0	.014
indecisive	26	18	.309
questioning	14	8	.262
satan*	0	7	.014
untrustworthy	8	1	.035
wrong	6	0	.029

*Note. Alpha level = .0056*

Table S6

*Fisher's Exact Results for Atheist Stereotype Content Comparisons*

<b>Word</b>	<b>Definition Provided Count</b>	<b>Definition Generated Count</b>	<b>p-value</b>
bad	4	10	.166
faithless	4	14	.025
intoleran*	20	13	.258
mean*	14	6	.099
rude	4	11	.106
satan*	9	14	.119
sin*	1	6	.379

*Note. Alpha level = .0071*

## Study 2 – Covariates

**Personal versus Societal Ratings.** After being provided with a definition for the group they were about to rate, they were asked to: “Please move the slider to the spot that you think SOCIETY would consider to be most representative of XXXX” in the societal condition or “Please move the slider to the spot that you think is most representative of XXXX” in the personal condition. The societal condition was coded as -1 and the personal condition was coded as 1.

**Attitude-based Political Orientation.** Participants completed the Attitude-based Political Orientation Scale (ABPO; Burton, 2016) to assess their political orientation. There are three subscales: libertarian independence (Cronbach’s  $\alpha = .95$ ;  $M = 3.02$ ;  $SD = 1.35$ ; [1.00, 7.00]), religious traditionalism (Cronbach’s  $\alpha = .91$ ;  $M = 3.14$ ;  $SD = 1.57$ ; [1.00, 7.00]), and ethnic separateness (Cronbach’s  $\alpha = .86$ ;  $M = 2.90$ ;  $SD = 1.34$ ; [1.00, 7.00]).

**Personality.** Participants completed the 10-item Personality Inventory (TIPI; Gosling et al., 2003) to assess their level of openness ( $M = 5.14$ ;  $SD = 1.30$ ; [1.00, 7.00]), conscientiousness ( $M = 5.36$ ;  $SD = 1.31$ ; [1.00, 7.00]), and agreeableness ( $M = 5.46$ ;  $SD = 1.16$ ; [2.50, 7.00]). Cronbach’s alphas were not calculated due to each subscale being comprised of only two items.

Participants also completed the Orderliness subscale from the Big-Five Aspects Scale (DeYoung et al., 2007) to assess their level of orderliness (Cronbach’s  $\alpha = .87$ ;  $M = 4.75$ ;  $SD = 1.11$ ; [1.50, 7.00]).

**Progressivism.** Participants completed the Moral Foundations Questionnaire (Graham et al., 2011; Haidt & Graham, 2007) to assess which moral foundations they deem as most important. A Progressivism score ( $M = 1.30$ ;  $SD = 1.48$ , [-3.31, 5.00]) was calculated by summing the ingroup, authority, and purity subscales and subtracting the resulting number from the sum of the fairness and harm subscales.

**Familiarity.** Participants responded on a scale, ranging from 0(*very unfamiliar*) to 100(*very familiar*), their level of familiarity with each group.

## References

- Burton, C. (2016). Three foundations of American conservative political orientation: Masculine independence, religious traditionalism, and ethnic separateness [Unpublished doctoral dissertation]. University of Toronto.
- DeYoung, C.G., Quilty, L.C., Peterson, J.B. (2007). Between facets and domains: 10 aspects of the Big-Five. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 93(5), 880-896.  
<https://www.doi.org/10.1037/0022-3514.93.5.880>
- Gosling, S. D., Rentfrow, P. J., & Swann Jr., W. B. (2003). A very brief measure of the Big-Five personality domains. *Journal of Research in Personality*, 37(6), 504-528.  
[https://doi.org/10.1016/S0092-6566\(03\)00046-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0092-6566(03)00046-1)
- Graham, J., Nosek, B. A., Haidt, J., Iyer, R., Koleva, S., & Ditto, P. H. (2011). Mapping the moral domain. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 101(2), 366-385.  
<https://doi.org/10.1037/a0021847>
- Haidt, J., & Graham, J. (2007). When morality opposes justice: Conservatives have moral intuitions that Liberals may not recognize. *Social Justice Research*, 20(1), 98-116.  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11211-007-0034-z>